Hopes Fulfilled or Dreams Shattered?  
From resettlement to settlement Conference 
November 23\textsuperscript{rd} - 28\textsuperscript{th}, 2005 

Background Paper 

Refugee Resettlement Conference with a focus on Housing, Cultural Identity and Community Development in Resettlement of Refugees 

Written By: J Gore 

This background paper has been prepared to inform discussion at this conference and does not necessarily represent the views of the Centre for Refugee Research.
Hopes Fulfilled or Dreams Shattered: Refugee Resettlement Conference with a focus on Housing, Cultural Identity and Community Development in Resettlement of Refugees

A paper by Jo Gore

What is a refugee?

What is a refugee?
Well and good to answer.
To answer such a question we need to be careful, because those who can answer it are very rare in this world.

To answer such a question, needs you first to take refuge, otherwise your answer will be simple and meaningless.

As refugees we are victims of violence and war.
We left our motherland because we were being mistreated in many ways.
We ran to get protection in other countries.

But as a refugee, you are always simple in front of anybody.
You are subject to prejudice and mistaken always.
You are a human being without any value.
You can pass through any disaster and nobody will care about you.

Oh! What is lovely like our homeland?
In your own country, you are free,
free like a butterfly when it flies from flower to flower,
free like a fish moving in the water.
Homeland is a second heaven.
Without your home you are like a dog without a tail.

Give us peace,
To return back to our beloved country, our precious heaven Sudan.
Give us our ancestors’ land.
Africa, live in peace forever!

By Andrew Mayak
The Sudan
1995
Preamble

Resettlement of refugees is one of the three durable solutions the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) works for in partnership with governments, humanitarian organisations, the private sector and sometimes the military (UNHCR 2005b). “Through resettlement refugees gain legal protection - residency and often eventually citizenship - from governments who agree, on a case-by-case basis to open up their communities to new members” (UNHCR 2005a). The broad focus of this paper is the provision of suitable housing for refugees which remains a central issue of resettlement (Interview notes, Service Provider 1, 6th October, 2005). The specific focus of this paper is the impact of housing in resettlement on cultural identity and community.

Background

Studies conducted in a number of resettlement countries have shown that resettled refugees tend to be over-represented in insecure and substandard housing, to suffer discrimination in the housing market, and to be relatively mobile in the early resettlement period (Mattu 2002: Beer and Foley 2003). Without satisfactory housing, refugees find it hard to access services such as health, education and employment (Greater London Authority 2004:12 cited in Murdie, R.A. 2005; UNHCR 2002; Carey-Wood et al 1995, p.56 cited in Beer and Foley 2003, p.4). Secure housing is also regarded as an essential component to recovery from the often hazardous migratory journey and the experiences of persecution, incarceration, torture or violence in their countries of origin (Zetter and Pearl, 1999, p.2 cited in Beer and Foley 2003, p.4; Hodes 2002 p.368-369). The European Council on Refugees and Exiles (ECRE) (1999, p.11 cited in Gray and Elliott 2001,) observed that one of the many issues facing refugees in seeking suitable accommodation is the failure of specific needs being recognised by housing providers such as the Department of Housing. One specific need is the cultural suitability of housing for resettled refugees. This is especially important for refugees who have not chosen to migrate, and who have (usually) been wrenched from everything familiar - their culture, networks and country. This is a recurring yet unexplored theme in the literature.

Literature Review

UNHCR views resettlement as a mechanism for refugee protection, a durable solution, and an element of burden and responsibility sharing (UNHCR 2005c) yet not as a right of the

---

1 This paper supports the view that all asylum seekers are refugees until found not to be. “The act of recognition of refugee status does not make someone a refugee. S/he has been a refugee all along…” (Refugee Council of Australia 2005) However, for the purpose of this paper the word refugee refers to “the refugee component of the humanitarian program and those who are granted refugee status after having been held in immigration detention centres” (Refugee Council of Australia 2005).
individual (UNHCR 2005d). According to UNHCR, before a decision is taken to pursue the resettlement of a refugee, every effort should be made to fully explore the possibility of local solutions such as local integration, and the possibility of voluntary repatriation in the foreseeable future should also be evaluated (UNHCR 2005d). Regarding legal and/or physical protection, resettlement is deemed appropriate when a refugee's situation meets one or more of the following conditions: “Immediate or long-term threat of refoulement to the country of origin or expulsion to another country from where the refugee may be refouled; Threat of arbitrary arrest, detention or imprisonment; Threat to physical safety or human rights in the country of refuge, rendering asylum untenable” (UNHCR 2005d).

Adding weight to the UNHCR resettlement guidelines is the Agenda for Protection. The Agenda came out of the Global Consultations on International Protection – a discussion between governments, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), refugee experts and UNHCR. It focuses on issues and activities that would benefit from multilateral commitment and cooperation (UNHCR 2003, p.9-10). The Agenda consists of the Declaration of States Parties which underpins the Programme of Action. “The Programme of Action identifies specific objectives and activities grouped according to six inter-related goals: strengthening implementation of the 1951 Convention and its 1967 Protocol; protecting refugees within broader migration movements; sharing burdens and responsibilities more equitably and building capacities to receive and protect refugees; addressing security-related concerns more effectively; redoubling the search for durable solutions for refugees; and meeting the protection needs of refugee women and children (UNHCR 2003, p.10). The Agenda for Protection is followed up by the Executive Committee (EXCOMM) and its Standing Committee (EXCOMM 2005a). In 1991 EXCOMM affirmed resettlement as an instrument of protection “only as a last resort, when neither voluntary repatriation nor local integration is possible” (EXCOMM 2005b). EXCOMM 2005 reiterated that UNHCR will focus on the six goals of the Agenda for Protection Programme of Action and will redouble their efforts to find durable solutions (UNHCR 2005e).

There are at least twelve different texts adopted and proclaimed by the United Nations explicitly recognising the right to adequate housing (UNHCR 1997 cited in ECRE 2002, p.5). One of these is Article 25 of the Universal Declaration on Human rights stating that housing is a fundamental human right (UN 2005) The UNHCR International guide to reception and integration contains a chapter section focusing on access to secure and affordable housing in resettlement (UNHCR 2002, p.161). Goal six of the guide specifically states that it is important for states to promote cultural and religious integrity” (UNHCR 2002, p.160). This is supported by Article 1 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights that “All peoples have the right of self-determination... [and to] ...freely pursue their
economic, social and cultural development” (OHCHR 2005a). Strengthening this is Article 27 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights affirming that “In those States in which ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities exist, persons belonging to such minorities shall not be denied the right, in community with the other members of their group, to enjoy their own culture, to profess and practise their own religion, or to use their own language” (OHCHR 2005b)

Culture and identity are interlinked. A sense of identity requires a group or community to support that identity (Little et al 2002, p.172). It is “culturally and structurally determined: ...tied to a grid of social roles, statuses, groups and networks” (Colic-Peisker and Walker 2003, p.338). Characteristics of (psychological) sense of community include the “perception of similarity to others, an acknowledged interdependence with others... the feeling that one is part of a larger, dependable and stable structure” (Sarason, 1974, p.156 cited in Fisher and Sonn, 1999, p. 716) A sense of community does not appear to be a priority with government housing providers. Members of the same ethnic group are often dispersed across cities and countries creating cultural difficulties for refugees2. The Hmong have a soul-calling ceremony performed on the third morning after the birth of a child. However, the Hmong community in Australia are scattered and such rituals can be delayed for up to a month (Liamputtong 2002, p.830-831).

It has been suggested that one’s home “represents a vital interface between society and the individual” (Mallett 2004, p.68). Home is a place where “socio-cultural and historical ideas about family, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality and age are reinforced...” (Mallett 2004, p.78). Mallett (2004, p.62) suggests that “…the house itself, the interior design of the house and the decorations and use of space all reflect the occupant’s sense of self”. It has been observed that many refugees turn their transition housing into a culturally appropriate space with rugs and minimal furniture, making a more flexible space by using mattresses instead of beds (Interview notes, Service Provider 3, 21st October, 2005). In a New Zealand Housing paper it was recorded that Somali families struggled with having only one toilet that was accessed through the kitchen. Traditionally a female domain, it was difficult when men had to pass through that space. Somali traditionally do not mix the genders after the age of seven and separate living spaces were required (Lilley, S 2004, p.16).

2 Placing refugees of the same ethnic group together can also be problematic. In the Tamil community in northern Norway, families that belong to different castes were placed in the same community. This created tension as they endeavoured to keep separate from the other castes yet yielded to their need to be part of the Tamil community (Gronseth, A.S 2001, p.506). Refugees may also choose to live separate to their communities due to a sense of shame about the conditions of their housing or as a result of experiences in their home country creating distrust within communities (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, 24th October, 2005).
Home is also a space where beliefs are enacted about who takes particular journeys and for what reasons. This is particularly evident in some of the literature on refugees. “[T]he conditions under which people leave their homelands, their journeys beyond and away from home and their destinations are all said to impact on [refugees] identity and understanding of home” (Mallett 2004, p.78) When refugees flee their homeland they leave behind social roles and networks, and their homes within which these were enacted. When they arrive in the country of permanent settlement, they face the formidable task of acculturation and rebuilding their disconnected and often shattered identities (Colic-Peisker and Walker 2003, p.338). Geographical migration does not necessarily threaten identity, however, refugees well-being and adjustment is dependent upon how they respond and the nature of the resources available to them³ (Timitijevic and Breakwell 2000, p357; Fisher and Sonn 2002, p.598).

Policy Review - with a focus on NSW State policy
Resettled refugees in Australia are entitled to income support, housing, medical assistance, torture and trauma counselling, English language instruction and employment (Refugee Council of Australia 2005). To be eligible to apply to rent public housing in Australia, refugees must be receiving Centrelink payments or be on a low income (DIMIA 2005a). Further criterion in each state will influence the outcome of the application. Each state has an ethnic or multicultural affairs office which promote the equal and fair treatment of culturally and linguistically diverse groups of people.

In 2003-04 New South Wales received 3,507 Humanitarian settler arrivals. Of these, 802 people (22.9per cent) were accepted as Refugees (DIMIA 2005). When refugees arrive they are eligible to stay in ‘On Arrival Accommodation’ (OAA) for four weeks or in government provided emergency accommodation for thirteen weeks (Refugee Council of Australia 2005: Dept. of Housing 2002a; Interview notes, Service Provider 4, 14th October, 2005) with a possible extension to six months on a case by case basis (Dept. of Housing 2002a). Refugees must then approach the Department of Housing for rental assistance in the private sector or put their name down for social housing either public or community⁴. “To be placed on the Housing Register an applicant must meet all of the following criteria.

- Citizenship or permanent residency of Australia

---

³ “The outcomes of identity and acculturation processes are ultimately determined by the interaction of two sets of factors: characteristics of immigrants and responses of the receiving society. A refugee group with its particular characteristics – ‘visibility’, cultural distance form the host society, human and social capital represented in the group – and the host society with its specific treatment of immigrants through official policies and informal encounters, create a series of cumulative, compounded and mutually reinforcing actions and reactions that determine the shape and direction of the processes of acculturation and identity re-building” (Colic-Peisker and Walker 2003, p.339).
⁴ As at 30 June 2005, in New South Wales, there is a waiting list of 68,000 applicants for social housing 29% of which are from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds (Interview Notes, Service Provider 5, 19th October, 2005).
- Residence in NSW
- Household income
- Asset ownership
- Ability to sustain a successful tenancy
- Repayment of former debts
- Generally, be at least 18 years of age” (Dept. of Housing 2002b).

In this case rental assistance is the primary form of assistance (Interview notes, Service Provider 5, 19th October, 2005). It would seem that the Commonwealth Government views social assistance such as housing as a transitional goal, “as an instrumental pathway to escape state dependency” (Marston 2003, p.5)

A new eligibility criteria is being developed under the Reshaping Public Housing Reform. Applicants will need to demonstrate that they are on a low income and have the greatest need such as belonging to one of the following groups:
- the frail elderly and aged pensioners
- people with a disability
- young people with no family support
- the homeless
- families with children
- unemployed and low waged adults

It is assumed, as the policy is still under development, that refugees will have to fit into one of these categories, as well as be financially in difficulty, to be eligible for housing. Trauma may be a part of the eligibility criteria in terms of health issues (Interview notes, Service Provider 5, 19th October, 2005).

The Department of Housing in New South Wales considers religious and cultural needs only in relation to other identified or recognised needs such as age or disability. The Department is implementing the Housing Multicultural NSW Framework which involves strategies to develop and acquire future housing assets, paying particular attention to number of bedrooms, cooking facilities and the internal and external recreational spaces (Interview notes, Service Provider 5, 19th October, 2005). Despite state Government assistance, and help from refugee support groups, ethnic organisations and community groups, the major source of assistance in securing housing for refugees are often friends and relatives (Beer and Foley 2003). At present the Integrated Humanitarian Settlement Service (IHSS), once government funded and having been put up for tender, now has a new provider. This means there is a loss of knowledge as existing workers finish. The effects of the changeover are rippling throughout the sector from employees through to refugees (Interview notes, Service Provider 1, 6th October, 2005).
Current Situation in Australia and Internationally

The path to accessing housing has many obstacles - language problems, financial struggles, difficulties finding appropriate and affordable housing, a lack of familiarity with Australian society rules and legal framework, and unhelpful real estate agents (Beer and Foley 2003, p.19). In terms of suitable housing the main concern for refugees lies in proximity to services such as transport, medical centres, schools and employment. Transport is particularly important for maintaining networks with family and friends (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, October, 2005). Once housing is obtained the main concern becomes paying rent and bills (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, October, 2005), however overcrowding, the condition of housing - such as rotting window frames, leaking roofs, damp and mould – and no place to sit outside have been recognised as other concerns (Beer and Foley 2003, p.26).

Cultural identity is not in the foreground whilst such pressing issues remain, however varying expressions of cultural concerns are present. A recent pilot study by architectural students at Sydney University revealed that the majority of NESB recipients of public housing they interviewed had cultural concerns with the design of housing provided. Three concerns raised were the desire for kitchen arrangements that facilitate traditional methods of food preparation, the arrangement of rooms to reflect cultural attitudes particularly in relation to cleanliness and hygiene, and the need for appropriate places of worship within the home. (Tierney, H 2004). In the hostels and close living quarters of some social housing, there is great diversity of culture. This can exacerbate issues such as cultural concepts of gender and appropriateness. Also there is a sense of loneliness and individuality which is culturally strange as everyone is going about the business of survival (Interview Notes, Service Provider 4, 14th October, 2005; Interview notes, Service Provider 6, 21st October, 2005).

The UNHCR (2002) handbook to Guide Reception and Integration regards a sound integration program as addressing the needs of resettled refugees with particular housing needs. Beer and Foley (2003) suggest that good practice requires assisting refugees through information provision and assistance with the private rental market; targeting housing assistance to locations where refugees desire to live; educating the wider community to reduce discrimination; and working to reduce discrimination in the housing market. These first two suggestions are supported by the Forced Migration Laboratory (2003) in California. Consultation with refugee tenants and host communities is regarded as best practice in New Zealand (Good Practice Participate 2003), Ireland (Reception and Integration Agency 2003), California (Forced Migration Laboratory 2003) and Asia (ADB 1998). The ADB (1998) also suggests that it is appropriate to provide a social preparation process for people affected
when they are vulnerable, or when there is social tension associated with displacement. Viewing housing in relation to other aspects of integration, such as health, employment and education is also regarded as good practice (ECRE 2002).

Despite the plethora of material on good practice, there are some clearly identifiable gaps in the policy and provision of housing in refugee resettlement. First and foremost is the need for adequate and affordable housing and better guidance through the legal and administrative framework of the housing market (Beer and Foley 2003). These are the immediate needs which are observed by case managers and service providers and are well documented. However, the cultural and religious needs of refugees are rarely taken into account in policy and only slightly more often in practice – another gap (UNHCR 2002). The long term cultural and religious needs, in particular, of refugees have not been observed.

One of the main reasons for this, which is another identifiable gap, is the lack of long term case management (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, 24th October, 2005). An aspect of resettled refugee communities that has not been explored in the literature, or in policy or practice, is that of the role of the elders as the interface between the ethnic community and wider community and within the ethnic community (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, 24th October, 2005).

Recommendation

“For many refugees in contemporary Australia, societal hope, wellbeing and meaning are crucial cultural resources that are being distributed on an unequal basis” (Marston 2005, p.118). It would seem that good community development, involving a rights based approach, which encourages participation and negotiation as ways to develop capacity and produce good processes, has yet to be implemented in relation to housing in refugee resettlement. This has been identified as good practice and could be a preventative and proactive way of dealing with the gaps and challenges.

---

5 When asked would it be appreciated if cultural and religious needs were accommodated in the housing of resettled refugees, the response was ‘Hugely!’ (Interview notes, Service Provider 2, 24th October, 2005).
References


EXCOMM, site updated 8 October 2005b, *EXCOMM conclusions: resettlement as an instrument of protection (No. 67 (XLII) - 1991)*, United Nations High Commissioner for


Marston, G 2003 ‘Rethinking social inequality: the case of illegal refugees’, *Social Inequality Today*, Macquarie University (can be found at <http://www.crsi.mq.edu.au/Social%20Inequality%20Today/Marston.pdf>)


Tierney, H 2004, Report on the Pilot Study undertaken in collaboration with the Department of Architecture, University of Sydney into Accommodating Cultural Diversity in Public Housing, December


UNHCR updated 15 October 2005d, *Resettlement Handbook Chapter 4 - UNHCR criteria for determining resettlement as the appropriate solution*, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, viewed 15 October 2005,

**Annotated Bibliography - Major International Literature**


This handbook provides information about the resettlement process and strategies for the resettlement process. It was designed to be a reference for Bank staff and consultants on mission.


A study looking at the pathways of housing for refugees and their experiences of housing provision. It also looks at policy implications and provides some thoughts on good practice.


This guide focuses on integration through housing in Europe providing information and practices that address policy and enhance the process.


A report from the six lead agencies in the ECRE Task Force on Integration looking at policy development, employment, vocational training, education, housing, community and culture, and health.
These are the conclusions adopted by the Executive Committee on the international protection of refugees from 1975-2004.


A literature review aimed to help interested parties understand more fully the process of refugee resettlement, and to summarise some of the key factors or barriers that impact on resettlement. This review is part of The Refugee Resettlement Research Project (Refugee Voices) developed by the New Zealand Immigration Service.

Lilley, S 2004, updated 2005, Vulnerable migrant groups: a housing perspective. An assessment of the housing needs, wants and experiences of Christchurch's Somali community, Housing New Zealand, viewed 15 October 2005,

An assessment of the housing needs, wants and experiences of Christchurch's Somali community as part of an overall examination of the housing needs, wants and experiences of vulnerable migrant groups.


A report documenting the extent of housing needs and substandard housing problems among immigrants and refugees with recommendations for policy direction. It aims to examine the factors contributing to immigrant and refugee homelessness, to determine the necessary changes required to prevent refugee homelessness, and to recommend solutions and actions including a community based approach.

Murdie, R.A 2005, updated 14 October 2005, Pathways to housing: the
This study investigates the experiences of refugees in making their way from transitional accommodation to more permanent housing in Toronto. It also contrasts the housing experiences of sponsored refugees (selected abroad by the government or a private agency) and refugee claimants (asylum seekers).

<http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?ID=52>
An overview of resettlement.

<http://www.ohchr.org/english/law/cescr.htm>
A human rights document established in International Law by the United Nations containing articles that outline the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of all people.

<http://www.ohchr.org/english/law/ccpr.htm>
A human rights document established in International Law by the United Nations containing articles that outline the Civil and Political Rights of all people.

The guide is aimed at housing professionals working in local authorities, housing associations and the independent sector. It should also be useful to refugee community organisations and to those responsible for training and development on housing, housing support and asylum and refugee issues. Almost 50 practical examples have been included to
show how housing and other organisations have responded to the needs of new migrants in different parts of the UK. The guide recommends or sets out ‘good practice’.


These guidelines provide in-depth guidance on the steps that local authorities should implement in order to achieve good practice in the various aspects of their housing management function. They also suggest a wide range of actions which, depending on their individual circumstances and resources, local authorities may strive to implement in order to achieve best practice in housing management.


A human rights document established in International Law by the United Nations containing articles that outline the fundamental human rights of all people.


The focus of this Chapter is on strategies for supporting resettled refugees to obtain long term, safe, secure and affordable housing.


The Agenda for Protection is the product of a consultative process that occurred in December 2000 called the Global Consultations on International Protection. It focuses on suggested activities which would strengthen international protection of asylum-seekers and refugees and improve implementation of the 1951 Convention and its 1967 Protocol. These activities flow from the Declaration adopted unanimously by States Parties to the 1951
Convention and/or its 1967 Protocol at the Ministerial Meeting of States Parties, organized jointly by Switzerland and UNHCR on 12–13 December 2001, to commemorate the Convention’s 50th anniversary.

The UNHCR guide to resettlement of refugees with a chapter looking at each resettlement country.

A summary of UNHCR’s objectives in 2005 in providing international protection within the broad goals of the agenda for Protection including a look at the priorities and activities of the Department of International Protection (DIP).

This feasibility study on resettlement was called for by the Commission in summer 2002 with the aim of “identifying conditions for drawing up EC instruments which would include rules on resettlement in all Member States or at EU level”.

20
**Other information to peruse and Websites to visit**


A summary of refugee admissions and resettlement policy in the United States including post September 11 admissions.


The summary of a paper that explores the impact on refugee housing and community development of the Immigration and Asylum Act 1999; that draws national lessons by examining the experience of one specific dispersal region, Yorkshire and Humberside; and attempts to make a constructive contribution towards integration which keeps the needs of asylum seekers and refugees at its heart and highlights good practice to lead future efforts.


A summary of a presentation of the Canadian model of resettlement; A look at dispelling some assumptions that have typically been made in discussions and/or policy decisions relating to asylum and resettlement programs; and a non-governmental perspective on the issue of resettlement policy.


Questions and answers relating to Asylee eligibility for assistance and services in the United States.


Framed in the context of refugee resettlement in San Diego County, California, the Roundtable brought together a panel of practitioners, policymakers, and academics currently engaged in work with this group. Complementing the local participants were several practitioners that engage in similar work at the international level. The Roundtable specifically focused upon two major, inter-related areas in resettlement: micro-enterprise/job creation strategies and psycho-social programs.


A New Zealand government initiative that guides the reader through the steps of a formal consultation.


A report on a symposium which analyzed the major causes of displacement in Africa, identified the multiple risk groups, explored the multidimensional risks they encounter, and discussed the strategies for countering displacement problems.


The summary of a paper that aims to identify the needs and aspirations of refugees in the region regarding ‘move-on’ accommodation, in the context of ‘integration’ and of ‘retention’ of refugees dispersed to the North East of England and to identify ‘requirements for success’ of any future second stage housing provision.

Wegelin, E 2005, ‘Facing the metropolitan challenge: recent housing resettlement and reconstruction in south eastern Europe’, *Global Urban Development* vol.1 issue 1, May, also found at <http://www.globalurbandevelopment.org/Issue1PlMag05/Wegelin%20PDF.pdf>
This short paper looks at the (re-) settlement of refugees and internally displaced persons both in the countries of origin and in recipient countries and possible ways forward.


This website offers information about the European Council on Refugees & Exiles (ECRE) and provides links to other organizations and partners of ECRE. ECRE is an umbrella organisation of 76 refugee-assisting agencies in 30 countries working towards fair and humane policies for the treatment of asylum seekers and refugees.


A summary, in question and answer form, of The Gateway Protection Programme (GPP) which is the official name given to the UK's resettlement programme.

Home Office, site updated 21 October 2005, Quota refugee resettlement programme, Home Office UK, viewed 23 October 2005  

A summary, in question and answer form, of UK Quota Refugee Resettlement Programme.


This is the web page of RMS (formerly known as refugee and Migrant Service), a non-profit, non-governmental, non-sectarian incorporated society in New Zealand. They provide public and community education programs and monitor and contribute to the development of national and international policies relating to refugee resettlement.


An overview of the Resettlement Programme in the United States.

<http://uscis.gov/graphics/howdoi/refapp.htm>
A webpage setting out the questions and answers to resettlement procedure for refugees in the United States.